Congress of the United States Washington, DC 20515

March 19, 2014

The Honorable Sally Jewell Secretary U.S. Department of the Interior 1849 C Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20240

Dear Secretary Jewell:

Last month the National Center for Ecological Analysis and Synthesis (NCEAS) released its peer review report for the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service's (Service) proposed rule to remove Endangered Species Act (ESA) protection for all gray wolves other than a small experimental population of Mexican wolves being reintroduced in Arizona and New Mexico. The findings of this independent scientific review validate concerns raised by Congress and the scientific community over the Service's failure to use the best available science to support the gray wolf delisting proposal. Specifically, the expert panelists noted explicitly that the rule does not currently represent the best available science, that there is not currently sufficient scientific basis for recognizing a separate "eastern wolf" as asserted in the rule, and that the rule presents no evidence excluding the gray wolf from an historic range in the eastern United States.

The Service's claim in the proposed rule that the gray wolf has recovered and should no longer be listed as endangered hinged on the purported existence of a distinct eastern wolf. The peer review report found that the existing scientific literature provides absolutely no basis for this conclusion. Therefore, we are again asking you to direct the Service to rescind the proposed rule. As you said when speaking at the Children, Conservation, and the Future of the Great Outdoors event last June, deciding whether or not to remove ESA protection from the gray wolf "is about science, and you do what the science says."

While we are troubled by the certainty with which the Service proceeded in this instance, even in the face of clear scientific disagreement, we are pleased that the agency finally heeded our calls for an independent peer review of the rule. Still, we have serious concerns regarding the initial attempts to exclude top wolf experts from this process, and the resurrection of a long-dormant government journal to "publish" the study (written by four FWS employees) used to justify the rule. These actions cast doubt on Service Director Dan Ashe's recent statement that his agency has no "desire to wring our hands and walk away from wolves."

Because it is not based on the best available science, the proposed rule undermines decades of conservation work done to protect the gray wolf, and sets a bad precedent for future ESA delistings. Further, it would stifle gray wolf recovery at a time when conservation gains are only nascent in the Pacific Northwest, and recovery has yet to begin in California, Colorado, Utah, and the Northeast, where scientists have identified a significant amount of suitable habitat that would support wolf populations.

¹ http://www.npr.org/2013/12/27/257654599/after-major-comeback-is-the-gray-wolf-still-endangered

The ESA does not charge the Service with restoring only as much of the endangered species as it deems politically convenient. In fact, the purposes of the Act "are to provide a means whereby the ecosystems upon which endangered species and threatened species depend may be conserved [and] to provide a program for the conservation of such endangered species and threatened species."² The Service should rescind the proposed rule immediately, and continue to review the taxonomic history of wolves in the eastern United States, and other factors related to the status of endangered gray wolf populations and their associated ecosystems before removing federal protection.

Sincerely,

Peter DeFazio

Ranking Member Committee on Natural Resources

Rep. Ron Barber

Rep. Corrine Brown

Rep. Matt Cartwright

ep. Madeleine Bordallo

ep. Julia Brownley

irden

willine Rep. David Cicilline

² Endangered Species Act of 1973, section 2(b).

Rep. Katherine Clark (Oak

Rep. Emanuel

p. John Conyers

DeLavro

Rep. Rosa DeLauro

eith El

Rep. Keith Ellison

ha 3. Zehoo

Rep. Anna Eshoo

Run

Rep. Sam Farr

Rep. Luis Gutierrez

<u>Yuette (larke</u> Rep Yvette Clarke

amol Rep. Gerry Connolly

Cummings

Hed Kentel

Eliot L. Engel Rep. Eliot Engel

<u>lie alath</u> A. Esty Rep. Elizabeth Esty

(hib/Ste

Rep. Mike Fitzpatrick

Raul M. Hijalva

Rep. Raul Grijalva

3

Rep. Alcee Hastings

Rust Ha

Rep. Rush Hol

Rep. Jared Huffman

R.F

Jim Langevin

Rep. Sandy Levin

we Lebsack

Rep. Dave Loebsack

n Lowthil

Rep. Alan Lowenthal

Rep. Jim Himes

Mino M Hond Rep. Mike Hond

e tor

Steve Israel

Wm. Lary Clay Rep. Lacy Clay

Barbara Lee

Rep. John Lewis

the V

Rep. Nita Lowey

Rep. Stephen Lynch

Rep. Jim McGovern

Eorg liller

Rep. George Miller

Rep. Grace Napolitano

Bill Posselly. Rep. Bill Pascrell

Rep. Mark Pocan

Rep. Mike Quigley

Rep. Raul Ruiz

Jem McDermott

Rep Jerry McNerney

Rep. Jim Moran

Rep. Eleanor Norton

Rep. Ed Pastor

~ Rep. Charles Rangel

Lilih

Rep. Gregorio Kilili Camacho Sablan

the Kep. Jan Schakowsky K unt

Rep. Jose Serrano

Xinena Sten

Rep. Jackie Speier perer

12 Rep. John Tierney

Mile

Rep. Niki Tsongas

Rep. Nydia Velazquez

eter

Rep. Adam Schiff

Carol Shea-Porter Rep. Carol Shea-Porter

Chris Smith Rep. Chris Smith

Rep. Mark Takan

onto au

Rep. Paul Tonko

in Malle

redenca J. Wilson

Andy Chu Rep. Judy Chu

.

.